

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>p.</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	9

## INTRODUCTION

1. State secrecy in historical perspective	11
1.1. <i>Arcana imperii</i> in Ancient Rome	12
1.2. State secrecy and the advent of the Modern State	15
2. States' recourse to secrecy: current trends	18
3. Scope and structure of the book	31

## PART I

### DEFINING STATE SECRECY

#### CHAPTER 1

#### STATE SECRECY IN DOMESTIC LEGAL SYSTEMS

1. Introduction	35
2. Scope of State secrecy in domestic legal systems	37
3. Operation of State secrecy in domestic legal systems	43
3.1. Classification of information	43
3.1.1. Legal framework	43
3.1.2. Concerns associated with the practical implementation of classification rules	49
3.2. Rule of evidence and judicial bar to proceedings	54
3.2.1. Legal framework	54
3.2.2. Concerns associated with the practical implementation of secrecy claims in court	60
3.2.2.1. Rule of evidence	62
3.2.2.2. Judicial bar to proceedings	69
4. Conclusions	74

CHAPTER 2  
STATE SECRECY  
IN THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEM

1. Introduction	77
2. The protection of State secrecy in <i>ad hoc</i> treaty regimes	79
3. State secrecy as a rule of evidence in international adjudication	80
4. The so-called ‘originator control principle’: bilateral agreements and diplomatic practice	84
5. A special case: the International Committee of the Red Cross non-disclosure privilege	87
6. Conclusions	89

PART II  
STATE SECRECY AND THE INTERNATIONAL  
PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

CHAPTER 3  
STATE SECRECY  
AND TREATY MONITORING BODIES’ PRACTICE

1. Introduction	94
2. Classification of information and the right of access to State-held information	94
2.1. The emergence of a right of access to State-held information in international law	95
2.1.1. Universal level	95
2.1.2. Regional level	101
2.1.3. Soft law instruments	108
2.1.4. Specific issues: the fight against corruption and the protection of the environment	112
2.1.5. Domestic practice	115
2.1.6. From the right of access to State-held information to the right of access to information held by international organisations	120
2.2. The practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies on access to classified information	127
2.2.1. General overview	127
2.2.2. Access to information about gross human rights violations: a peculiar scenario?	136
2.3. Interim conclusions	141
3. Secret evidence, hearings and proceedings and the right to a fair trial	142

3.1. The contents of the right to a fair trial: a focus on the principles of equality of arms and adversarial proceedings	143
3.2. The practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies on secret evidence, hearings and proceedings	148
3.2.1. General overview	151
3.2.2. The use of security cleared lawyers: the appropriate solution to an apparently unresolvable dilemma?	159
3.3. Interim conclusions	160
4. State secrecy as an impediment to the establishment of legal responsibilities and the States' duty to investigate gross human rights violations and to prosecute and punish the perpetrators	164
4.1. The content of the duty to investigate gross human rights violations and prosecute and punish the perpetrators	165
4.2. Assessing State secrecy claims in light of the practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies on legal impediments to investigation and prosecution	173
4.3. Interim conclusions	177
5. State secrecy as a bar to access to justice and to reparation and the right to an effective remedy	178
5.1. The contents of the right to an effective remedy	178
5.1.1. Universal level	178
5.1.2. Regional level	181
5.2. The practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies on State secrecy and the right to an effective remedy	187
5.3. Interim conclusions	192
6. State secrecy and the right to know the truth about gross human rights violations	193
6.1. The emergence of the right to know the truth in international law	196
6.1.1. Origins and evolution	196
6.1.2. The (blurred) contours of the right to know the truth	201
6.1.3. Domestic practice	210
6.1.4. The legal status of the right to know the truth	215
6.2. The impact of the practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies concerning the right to know the truth on State secrecy	225
6.3. Interim conclusions	229
7. State secrecy and states of emergency	229
8. A peculiar case: secret evidence and the duty to cooperate with international adjudicatory bodies	239
9. Conclusions	247

CHAPTER 4  
STATE SECRECY BEYOND TREATIES:  
TOWARDS A CUSTOMARY NORM PROHIBITING  
RECOURSE TO STATE SECRECY TO CONCEAL  
GROSS HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS?

1. Introduction	251
2. General practice	252
2.1. 'Individual' State practice	253
2.1.1. Acts of the executive branch	253
2.1.2. Legislative acts	255
2.1.3. Domestic case law	256
2.2. 'Collective' State practice: the case of resolutions adopted by international organisations' organs	258
2.3. Non-State practice	258
2.3.1. International organisations' practice	258
2.3.2. The practice of human rights treaty monitoring bodies	259
2.3.3. The practice of non-governmental organisations	259
3. Considerations on the <i>opinio juris</i> inferable from the analysis of practice	260
4. State of necessity: a circumstance precluding wrongfulness?	262
5. Conclusions	263

PART III  
THEORETICAL AND PRACTICAL ISSUES ARISING FROM  
THE HORIZONTAL AND VERTICAL INTERACTION  
AMONG NORMS AND LEGAL ORDERS

CHAPTER 5  
FROM STATE  
TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION SECRECY

1. Introduction	267
2. The United Nations	269
2.1. Classification of information	269
2.2. Use of secret evidence	270
3. The European Union	272
3.1. Classification of information	272
3.2. Use of secret evidence	277
4. The North Atlantic Treaty Organisation	280

	<i>p.</i>
5. ‘International organisation secrecy’ in top-down perspective: inter-systemic issues	281
5.1. Introduction to the problem	281
5.2. UN-mandated targeted sanctions and secret evidence: trumping human rights?	283
5.3. EU secrecy and Member States’ human rights obligations	288
6. International responsibility of intergovernmental organisations for the violation of human rights norms: contextualised considerations	289
7. Conclusions	292

CHAPTER 6  
**TO DISCLOSE OR NOT TO DISCLOSE STATE SECRETS?  
 THE DILEMMAS OF INTERSTATE COOPERATION  
 IN THE FIELD OF INTELLIGENCE, DIPLOMACY  
 AND MUTUAL LEGAL ASSISTANCE**

1. Introduction	293
2. When norms clash: human rights obligations and non-disclosure treaty provisions in the field of intelligence cooperation and diplomatic relations	293
2.1. Introduction to the problem	293
2.2. An attempt at resolution	294
3. Classified information and mutual legal assistance provisions	300
3.1. The current legal framework	302
3.2. A critical assessment and <i>de lege ferenda</i> proposals: closing the loopholes	303
3.3. Beyond interstate cooperation: access to information about gross human rights violations classified in third countries	307
4. Conclusions	309
 <i>General conclusions</i>	 311
 <i>Bibliography</i>	 319